



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/588,759	08/08/2006	Marco Ortalda	294467US0PCT	2938
22850	7590	05/13/2009		
OBLON, SPIVAK, MCCLELLAND MAIER & NEUSTADT, P.C. 1940 DUKE STREET ALEXANDRIA, VA 22314			EXAMINER NEGRELLI, KARA B	
			ART UNIT 1796	PAPER NUMBER
			NOTIFICATION DATE 05/13/2009	DELIVERY MODE ELECTRONIC

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

patentdocket@oblon.com  
oblonpat@oblon.com  
jgardner@oblon.com

**TIN AND TRANSITION METAL FREE POLYURETHANE FOAMS**

**ADVISORY ACTION**

1. Applicant's arguments filed 05/02/2009 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.
2. Applicant traverses the rejections made over Clatty 2003/0166735, due to the fact that Clatty could not have predicted the results as shown in Example 4 and Comparative Example 4 of the instant application.
3. Applicant's argument is not persuasive. Comparative Example 4 of the instant application is not representative of the closest prior art. The examples of the foams in Table 1 in Clatty 2003/0166735 use a tertiary amine catalyst A (polycat 8) in combination with tetraethylenediamine and dibutyl tin diacetate (a tin salt). Comparative example 4 of the instant application uses Niax D22 as a catalyst.
4. Applicant argues that because the Shore Hardness Values A and D "is like comparing apples to oranges," and that the composition terms "flexible" and "rigid" are not the same or similar end products.
5. Applicant's arguments are not persuasive. Neither Shore Hardness nor flexibility are claimed in the instant application. Furthermore, there is no evidence of record that the rigid foam of the prior art is less flexible than the foam of the instant application.
6. Applicant argues that Londrigan et al. does not teach a bismuth carboxylate catalyst and therefore cannot be used in combination with the reference taught by Clatty. However, note that while Londrigan does not disclose

Art Unit: 1796

all the features of the present claimed invention, Londrigan is used as teaching reference, and therefore, it is not necessary for this secondary reference to contain all the features of the presently claimed invention, *In re Nievelt*, 482 F.2d 965, 179 USPQ 224, 226 (CCPA 1973), *In re Keller* 624 F.2d 413, 208 USPQ 871, 881 (CCPA 1981). Rather this reference teaches a certain concept, an organic acid metal salt and a tertiary amine is a ratio of less than 3:1 (column 5, lines 44-47), and in combination with the primary reference, discloses the presently claimed invention.

7. Applicant argues that neither Priest nor Burckhardt et al. remedy the “deficiencies” in Clatty. However, due to the reasons specified above, Clatty does obviate the instantly claimed invention.

8. Accordingly, the office action filed March 31, 2009 is **FINAL**. See MPEP § 706.07(a). Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

### ***Conclusion***

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to KARA NEGRELLI whose telephone number is (571)270-7338. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday through Friday 8:00 am EST to 5:00 pm EST.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Randy Gulakowski can be reached on (571)272-1302.

Art Unit: 1796

The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/KARA NEGRELLI/  
Examiner, Art Unit 1796

/Randy Gulakowski/  
Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 1796